

**PROPOSAL RESULTS FOR RFP2013-43 FOR COST AND BENEFITS ANALYSES FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT  
11/22/13 @ 11:00 AM**

TERM OF CONTRACT: ONE (1) YEAR						
NUMBER OF RESPONDENTS:	6					
NAME OF BIDDER	JOHNSON CONSULTING, INC.	TETRA TECH, INC.	JONES LANG LASALLE AMERICAS, INC.	VALUE RESEARCH GROUP, LLC.	CENTER FOR GOVERNMENTAL RESEARCH, INC.	CAMOIN ASSOCIATES, INC.
ADDRESS	6 E. MONROE - 5TH FLOOR	240 CONTINENTAL DRIVE - SUITE 200	330 MADISON AVENUE - 4TH FLOOR	301 S. LIVINGSTON AVENUE - SUITE 104	1 SOUTH WASHINGTON STREET SUITE 400	120 WEST STATE STREET - SUITE 303
CITY, STATE, ZIP	CHICAGO, IL 60603	NEWARK, DE 19713	NEW YORK, NY 10017	LIVINGSTON, NEW JERSEY 07039	ROCHESTER, NEW YORK 14614	SARATOGA SPRINGS, NEW YORK 12866
CONTACT NAME	CHARLES JOHNSON	ANDY MAZZEO, NORTHEAST OPERATIONS MANAGER	PATRICK FLINN		JOSEPH STEFKO	ROBERT CAMOIN
TELEPHONE	312-447-2001 OR 312-447-2010	302-283-2233	212-812-5854	973-422-9800	585-327-7065	518-899-2608 EXT.#102
FAX	312-444-1125	302-454-5988	312-821-4985	973-422-9797	888-388-8521	512-777-5045
E-MAIL	<a href="mailto:CJOHNSON@CHJC.COM">CJOHNSON@CHJC.COM</a>	<a href="mailto:ANDY.MAZZEO@TETRATECH.COM">ANDY.MAZZEO@TETRATECH.COM</a>	<a href="mailto:PATRICK.FLINN@AM.JLL.COM">PATRICK.FLINN@AM.JLL.COM</a>	<a href="mailto:ALINFANTE@VALUERESARCH.COM">ALINFANTE@VALUERESARCH.COM</a>	<a href="mailto:JSTEFKO@CGR.ORG">JSTEFKO@CGR.ORG</a>	<a href="mailto:RCAMOIN@CAMOINASSOCIATES.COM">RCAMOIN@CAMOINASSOCIATES.COM</a>
STOCKHOLDER DISCLOSURE STATEMENT	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
REQUIRED EVIDENCE EEO/AFFIRMATIVE ACTION REGULATIONS QUESTIONNAIRE	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF RECEIPT OF ADDENDA	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
NJ BUSINESS REGISTRATION CERTIFICATE	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
NON-COLLUSION AFFADAVIT	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION STATEMENT	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT OF 1990 LANGUAGE	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
CERTIFICATION AND DISCLOSURE OF POLITICAL CONTRIBUTIONS	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
DISCLOSURE OF INVESTED ACTIVITIES IN IRAN	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
EIC	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	CERT.#39549 EXP.3/15/2016	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	CERT#21576 EXP. 8/15/2017	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	CERT.#49287 EXP.8/15/2019
60-DAY EXTENSION COMPLIANCE	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
EXCEPTIONS (IF ANY)	NONE	NONE	NONE	NONE	NONE	NONE
CERTIFICATE OF INSURANCE	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD	NEEDED PRIOR TO AWARD
EMERGENCY COMPLIANCE	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
W-9	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED	INCLUDED
TOTAL PRICE	SEE ATTACHED PRICE BREAK-DOWN	SEE ATTACHED PRICE BREAK-DOWN	SEE ATTACHED PRICE BREAK-DOWN	SEE ATTACHED PRICE BREAK-DOWN	SEE ATTACHED PRICE BREAK-DOWN	SEE ATTACHED PRICE BREAK-DOWN
FATAL FLAW	NONE	NONE	NONE	NONE	NONE	NONE



## ESTIMATED COST

Our proposed cost for the services requested in the RFP will vary based on the complexity and size of the project. We are willing to negotiate a not-to-exceed amount prior to the execution of any project.

The estimated cost for any project is based on our standard hourly rates, which are summarized in the following table. It is noted that all of the services provided by the Project Executive, Project Manager(s) and Project Analyst(s) are categorized as 'professional,' with Support duties being classified as 'administrative support.'

Johnson Consulting Inc. 2014 Hourly Rate Schedule	
Role	Hourly Rate
Project Executive	\$300
Project Manager	\$225
Project Analyst	\$125
Support	\$65

## PROPOSED BILLING AND PAYMENT STRUCTURE

Johnson Consulting typically bills for a third of the engagement at commencement of the project, a third of the agreed to amount at the midpoint of the process and then the balance once when the draft is completed. In our contract for the State of Kentucky, the developer is required to fund our work, and it is put in trust and paid to us when our work is completed.

## ESTIMATED TIMELINE

The estimated timeline for the services requested in the RFP will vary based on the complexity and size of the project. Prior to the execution of any project, we will negotiate an estimated timeline for each project. Our past experiences indicate that similar projects' timeframes typically range from four to eight weeks.

***Communications Strategies and Collateral Materials***

The Tetra Tech team also includes communications and public relations experts. On request, our team will consult with City staff to understand key and sensitive issue areas, and will develop a communications strategy, task timeline, and associated collateral materials. These tasks will help the City to communicate its project decisions, progress, and relevant information in inclusive, transparent formats that invite public participation and project “buy in. Costs for these work tasks can be provided separately.

**PROPOSED BILLING AND PAYMENT STRUCTURE**

Tetra Tech proposes to bill the City of Trenton for each project on a time-and-materials basis according the rate chart below, and will submit an invoice by the 15th of each month for the work performed in the previous month, due in 30 days.

<b>Proposed Rate Schedule RFP 2013-43</b>		
<b>NAME</b>	<b>PROJECT ROLE</b>	<b>LABOR RATE</b>
John Mizerak	Project Manager	\$135/hr.
Mason McClellan	Urban Planner	\$100/hr.
Roseann Cordelli	Communications	\$125/hr.
Alison Miskiman	Environmental Planner	\$110/hr.
Ryan Concklin	Community Planner	\$85/hr.
Emily Slotnick	Community Planner	\$70/hr.
Ralph Boedecker	Environmental Engineering	\$130/hr.
Harish Mital	Infrastructure Engineering	\$140/hr.
Casey Grabowski	Site Assessment	\$100/hr.
Charles Hill	Housing, Workforce, Outreach	\$110/hr.
Tracey Vernon	Brownfields, Land Use	\$110/hr.

**LOW-LEVEL ANTICIPATED TIMELINE FOR COMPLETION OF LOW-LEVEL COMPLEXITY PROJECTS**

Assuming all of the information is provided by the City of Trenton and the proposed development entity is available to provide any and all requested information:

- Conduct the cost-benefit analysis and provide a draft report within one (1) week from receipt of notice to proceed.
- A final report will be issued to the City within one (1) week.

***Mid-Level Complexity***

These projects are assumed to be typically mid-sized residential projects (25 units - 50 units) or commercial/industrial development of more than 1 acre, but less than 5 acres in size.

- 40-55 hours of work with a budget of approximately \$6,800
- \$400 in expenses
  - Includes meeting with the proposed developer, reviewing the proposed project, conducting the cost-benefit analysis, and preparing a report for the City
  - Includes two on-site meetings with City staff

**MID-LEVEL ANTICIPATED TIMELINE FOR COMPLETION OF MID-LEVEL COMPLEXITY PROJECTS**

Assuming all of the information is provided by the City of Trenton and the proposed development entity is available to provide any and all requested information:

- Conduct the cost-benefit analysis and provide a draft report within two (2) weeks from receipt of notice to proceed.
- A final report will be issued to the City within one (1) week.

***High-Level Complexity***

These projects are assumed to be typically large-scale residential projects (more than 50 units) or commercial/industrial development (more than 5 acres).

- 55-70 hours of work with a budget of approximately \$8,700
- \$500 in expenses
  - Includes meeting with the proposed developer, reviewing the proposed project, conducting the cost-benefit analysis, and preparing a report for the City
  - Includes two on-site meetings with City staff

**HIGH-LEVEL ANTICIPATED TIMELINE FOR COMPLETION OF HIGH-LEVEL COMPLEXITY PROJECTS**

Assuming all of the information is provided by the City of Trenton and the proposed development entity is available to provide any and all requested information:

- Conduct the cost-benefit analysis and provide a draft report within three (3) weeks from receipt of notice to proceed.
- A final report will be issued to the City within one (1) week.

**ADDITIONAL OPTIONAL SERVICES**

***Public Funding Strategies***

The Tetra Tech team is comprised of public funding experts. On request, our team will evaluate the opportunities to leverage state and federal financial assistance for a proposed project, and will develop a public funding strategy. Our team can also prepare the applications and supporting documentation for individual public funding opportunities, and can prepare and assist with the implementation of a communications strategy for key stakeholders of the project. Costs for these work tasks can be provided separately.

# 1 Project Cost & Time Estimate

## 1.1 Period of Performance

In accordance with the RFP and based on providing Cost-Benefit Analyses, Jones Lang LaSalle has structured our proposed fee schedule, which is valid until November 19, 2014.

## 1.2 Project Timeline

Depending upon the complexity and/or size of each contract, Jones Lang LaSalle estimates a 4-6 week timeline for each assignment. This assumes that all materials will be provided timely by the client, all deliverables will be reviewed and approved or returned with comments in a timely manner, and that the client and project applicant(s) are available for meetings within a reasonable time frame.

## 1.3 Proposed Billing & Payment Structure.

Jones Lang LaSalle proposes billing hourly with invoices issued monthly.

Jones Lang LaSalle's labor hour rates offered in this proposal are fully-loaded rates, inclusive of overhead, G&A and profit. The proposed rates are consistent with the labor rates offered to other clients for similar services. Jones Lang LaSalle provides reasonable yet competitive rates for the services requested in the RFP. A rate sheet below includes each team member's hourly billing rates for the proposed services.

The following table provides our proposed hourly fees for each level of proposed staff, which are genuine and not the result of collusion or any other anti-competitive activity:

Name	Company	Title	Rate (USD per hour)
Patrick Flinn	Jones Lang LaSalle	Managing Director	\$375
Reginald Ross	Jones Lang LaSalle	Forecasting Director	\$325
Emily Crutcher	Jones Lang LaSalle	Associate	\$275
Monique King-Viehlend	Obsidian Development	Principal and Founder	\$250

We understand that the City of Trenton is seeking the "best value" for the services. Depending upon the type of contract, the "best value" may be realized in alternative forms of pricing. Jones Lang LaSalle is willing to offer additional discounts, flat fees, blended rates, fee caps and other forms of competitive pricing during a Mini-Bid or List Selection.

## 1.4 Expenses

Usual and customary expenses incurred in connection with the assignment are included within the hourly rates of this proposal. In addition, reimbursable expenses will be billed at actual cost, and will include, but are not limited to, the following expenses: reproduction of drawings, messenger service, overnight delivery, long-distance telephone charges, cellular expenses, facsimiles, out-of-state travel, lodging, parking, meals if required to stay overnight from time to time, and the cost of renting vehicles, including insurance.

## Fees

---

### Consulting Assignments/Expert Testimony

Consulting assignments include but are not limited to reviewing and assisting in the discovery process, additional research or review meetings subsequent to completion of the initial report, strategy sessions during the preparation of the report, review of any other studies, appraisals, or reports, outside the scope of the VRG report, and attendance at any formal or informal meetings or conferences.

In the event of a legal proceeding, Arthur A. Linfante III, MAI, CRE, or another representative of our firm, designated by you, will be available to provide testimony regarding the analysis and conclusions contained within the appraisal report.

All consulting services and expert testimony outlined in this proposal will be billed at the following hourly rates:

<b>Principals of the Firm:</b>	<b>\$200.00/hour</b>
<b>Senior Associates:</b>	<b>\$150.00/hour</b>
<b>Associates</b>	<b>\$140.00/hour</b>
<b>Support Staff:</b>	<b>\$ 75.00/hour</b>

A representative of our firm will not engage in any related consulting assignments or expert testimony until all outstanding fees are satisfied in full.

Hourly rates are calculated on 1/10<sup>th</sup> hour increments portal to portal. Invoices will be submitted monthly along with a detail as to the date, time, and type of work that was performed.



1. An hourly consultation fee charged per diem based on actual time spent providing consultation/service; and
2. A fixed pricing strategy that could be negotiated on a per diem, or project by project basis.

The second option is designed to empower the city on smaller and routine projects potentially reducing costs from not needing to engage CGR's professional services as often. We believe this will save the city significant money over time and still position key stakeholders with robust information.

## Option 1: Per Diem Project Analyses

For complex projects, CGR will provide professional consultation and analytical support. Our involvement could range from a complete economic and/or fiscal impact model with a full written report, to ad hoc consultation on modeling techniques and strategies that empower city staff to think about projects in a more strategic and economic manner. Each of these engagements will vary, and CGR proposes that we negotiate each engagement separately with the city on a per project basis.

### Option - 1A

The first level of financial agreement would be to charge a flat hourly rate if the anticipated involvement warrants only a few (5 -10) hours of time. CGR will bill the city on a per diem basis for professional services according to our standard hourly rates. The hourly rates for anticipated staff in each project include<sup>1</sup>:

- Chief Economist - \$230
- Associate Director - \$137
- Data Analyst - \$97
- Research Assistant - \$77

CGR is a not for profit 501(c)(3) consulting firm, and as such, we use a bundled rate approach to project budgeting. Bundled rates are set for each position title and include direct expense (salary and benefits) as well as other than personal services (rent, insurance, etc.) and administrative and overhead charges (organizational and fiscal oversight).

---

<sup>1</sup> Quoted rates are for Calendar Year 2013. Rates are subject to change in 2014.



## **Option - 1B**

The second level of financial agreement would be a fixed fee for a robust project specific economic/fiscal impact analysis with written report. We anticipate these types of engagements would range in cost between \$7,500 and \$15,000 and would be negotiated on a per project basis as the needs arise.

The above hourly rates **do not** include travel costs. Technology has developed significantly over the last several years and CGR does not anticipate needing to be onsite to play a valuable role in most projects. Either through the use of Skype or other telephone or video conference capabilities, we believe we can limit travel and onsite time and not diminish the value we can bring to the project.

However, certain projects may require something unanticipated and the city may suggest that an onsite project review may be advantageous. Any travel costs, or costs associated with required onsite meetings will be billed at cost by CGR to the city on a per diem basis in addition to our billing rates outlined above. The exception would be when a fixed price contract is negotiated, in which case CGR will include travel costs as part of the negotiated fixed fee.

## **Option 2: City of Trenton Economic Impact Model using informANALYTICS**

CGR proposes to create a customized web-based informANALYTICS model for the City of Trenton for \$9,800 at the outset of our engagement. This will include full customization, website development, full tax rate research and integration into the model, set up for economic multipliers and incentive programs, adaptation of the city's application to data entry fields in the tool, and customization of reports. CGR will also provide up to one half day of onsite training to relevant city staff if requested.

Annually thereafter, beginning on January 1 of the year following full implementation of the tool, and every year thereafter, CGR will bill the City of Trenton an annual maintenance fee to keep the informANALYTICS model current. Updates will include tax rates, multipliers, and reporting. CGR will provide ongoing technical support and will be the primary host for the informANALYTICS model on our servers. CGR will charge the city \$1,250 annually for these services.

## **Additional Analyses**

While there are standard reports built into the informANALYTICS tool, there may be occasions where the city desires a customized narrative or analysis of a project. CGR offers to conduct a separate additional write-up



## Cost Estimate

Camoin Associates has found that all economic and fiscal impact analyses require varying amounts of time and work to complete. With this in mind, Camoin Associates estimates that the cost for a typical analysis as defined in the Requested Services outlined in the RFP is \$8,000 per study. As in past work with other municipal entities, certain analyses require significant additional research and documentation of assumptions and may require additional fees which would be negotiated on a case-by-case basis.

Should the City require additional services or site visits not included in the negotiated scope for each analysis, Camoin Associates will charge on a time and expenses basis as follows:

### a. Hourly labor rates

Principal:	\$160.00 per hour
Senior Professional:	\$105.00 per hour
Professional:	\$85.00 per hour

b. Travel by private automobile will be charged at the maximum federal reimbursement rate per mile.

c. All other expenses (e.g. purchase of proprietary data, travel related expenses, etc.) will be charged at cost.

## Basis for Cost Estimate

Camoin Associates has an ongoing relationship with other municipal and public benefit organizations to provide similar services and has found that this is a reasonable cost estimate for average projects, however the final cost will be determined on a case-by-case basis.

## Proposed Billing and Payment Structure

Camoin Associates can work with the City to determine the most efficient billing and payment structure. Typically we submit an invoice for 50% upon contract execution and 50% upon delivery of the final product.

## Timeline for Providing Services

Camoin Associates can work within the timeframes required by the City of Trenton. On average, it takes approximately 4 weeks to complete a cost/benefit analysis assuming all information is readily available and/or provided as requested. For expedited cases, we can deliver a report in as little as two weeks should the need arise.